



## **The Way School Leaders Develop Tourism as A Viable Major in Vocational Education in West Papua**

**Agtisda Tiofanna Silalahi\***

*SMK Negeri 3 Manokwari, Indonesia*

\*Corresponding e-mail: [smkn3.manokwari@gmail.com](mailto:smkn3.manokwari@gmail.com)

### **Abstract**

This project examines the West Papuan community's assumptions regarding the vocational high school major in Tourism, specifically the high school in Manokwari that was established in 2007. Unfortunately, the expectations of the policy makers in the field of vocational education and tourism are not met by the low number of young people who are interested in the school and finally decide to enroll in the school. The Causal Layered Analysis (CLA) used in this study looks at the issues through each of four layers, namely the Litany, Systemic/Social Causes, Discourse/Worldview, and Myth/Metaphor. The analysis moves from the current scenario through the layers to the construction of a new alternative scenario. It is recognized that the school needs innovation in the paradigm of the relational type of leadership model. The recommendations propose four main areas of cooperation through the Appreciative Inquiry approach: 1) within the school, 2) with the community, 3) with the tourism business sector, and 4) with the local Department of Tourism and the Department of Education. The project fills the gap in the literature, which lacks research on tourism vocational high schools in West Papua.

**Keywords:** *School leaders, Tourism, Vocational education*

**DOI:** <https://doi.org/10.30598/matail.v1i2.4350>

### **BACKGROUND**

The provincial government has issued supporting policies in the Regional Tourism Development Plan Year 2013-2033 that details a twenty-year plan for the local area tourism development. The provincial government's plan is a response to the President's instruction specifically to regions that have the potential to improve through tourism. As a solution to the scarcity of skilled tourism personnel, tourism vocational high schools were established (Khurniawan, 2015), which had the further purpose of confronting the unemployment rate nationally. With 65% of the population being secondary school graduates (Andarina, 2008), the lack of graduate skills is evident.

The tourism sector has impacted the local economy directly in the form of job opportunities and business opportunities. There are now twelve sea resorts, sixty accommodation units, forty vessels, and so on. Meanwhile, in Manokwari, the capital city of West Papua, the development of the tourism sector is marked by the establishment of two standard hotels, the Swiss-Belhotel and the Aston Niu Hotel. Tourism developments in West Papua have been marked by two more vocational schools majoring in tourism, which raises important issues for further discussion.

Many assumptions can be made regarding the vocational tourism high schools in the region as educational facilities, but most of them are negative. The assumptions can be classified as coming from two groups of people. The first group is the public, while the second group is within the school's system and consists of the school members and the people who are in the local area tourism market. The first group mostly thinks that tourism vocational high schools are unqualified schools, while the second group holds two contrasting views about the school. Some members say that the tourism vocational high school is a stepping stone, while other people in the school think that the place is just any port in a storm.

The first assumption held by public or the community seemingly comes from an inherited, outdated mindset that claims SMAs or general high schools are the best places to reach your dream. The community believes that these general high schools are more qualified to educate their children than other types of school. They believe that the high number of successful people who graduated from senior high school since 1950s is sufficient evidence for them to take the same step. In addition, they have not yet realized the potential of economic success in the tourism industry. The general belief amongst community members has been that studying science and being a civil servant provide a more secure future. Therefore, many parents encourage their children to enroll in general high schools or vocational schools that major in business and economy. All high schools, except the tourism vocational high schools, have long been preferred by the community. No wonder that, every year, the tourism vocational schools have lower enrolments than the other schools.

The research questions addressing the research problems are "How might West Papuan tourism vocational high schools be developed for sustainability and relevance to the tourism sector". The following sub questions articulate the detailed issues for examination. The first question is what underlies the assumptions of the West Papuan community towards the tourism vocational high school in the region? Secondly, what will the future scenario be like? Third question is how will the future scenario be achieved? And the last question is how will the present and future narrative be told?

## **LITERATURE REVIEW**

### **A. Current Litany Tourism in Indonesia**

Recently, the growth of the tourism sector in Indonesia has contributed around 4.1% to the GDP, 5.9% of employment and 21.3% of the OECD Trade in Services figures (OECD, 2016). A researcher of Indonesian tourism from Jenderal Soedirman University, Chusmeru, said that the Indonesian tourism sector in the year 2018-2019 has experienced a significant and encouraging increase. The Indonesian tourism sector has made many achievements (Puspitasari, 2019) (Appendix B). Therefore, any policy aiming to supporting the tourism business should be linked to the education system in order to improve the number of qualified tourism personnel.

### **B. Most Community Perceptions**

According to H. Oktadiana and Chon (2017), most Indonesian people think that vocational education is a program requiring less academic performance and featuring lower quality processes than other long-established subject areas. Subrahmanyam (2014) even reports that many people believe enrolling in a vocational school means closing their future pathways. In Africa, for example, vocational schooling does not lead to higher education, teachers are low-paid and underqualified and educational environments are old-fashioned. The title of "second-

choice” is what most youngsters and their parents strenuously shun (Subrahmanyam, 2014). Vocational education does not prioritize the accepted areas of learning such as math, natural sciences, social sciences, but even in vocational schools, the most favoured subjects are business management and engineering. Therefore, it is evident that many parents are concerned about the academic credibility and legitimacy of the educational institution that their children enrol in. Other perceptions that the community have towards the tourism vocational education are revealed in the Jiang and Tribe (2009) study in China. The data show that the Chinese community behaves negatively towards vocational education because of the tourism industry’s well known features, such as “stressful jobs, lack of family life due to the nature of work, long working hours, fatiguing and unstable jobs, low social status, disappointing and unjust promotions, low income and poor well-being, unqualified managers, poor attitudes and behaviour of managers towards employees, incompetent co-workers, bad attitudes and behaviour of fellow workers, and poor physical working conditions for staff” (p. 16). Thus, even though the tourism industry in China is prosperous, the community’s attitude towards the business is generally negative.

### **C. Current Systemic Government Priorities in Tourism Sector**

The Ministry of Tourism (2015) highlighted in its National Development Strategy for 2015 – 2019 that the tourism sector has become one of the three leading sector development dimensions. Development of the national tourism sector is set in both National Medium-Term and Long Development Plan. The Strategic Plan for the Medium-Term Development of the Destination and Tourism Industry Years 2015- 2019 has the headings of General Conditions, Potentials and Problems, Vision, Mission, Objectives, Targets and Direction of Policy and Strategy for the Development of Destinations and Tourism Industry from 2015 to 2019. According to Law Number 2 (2015), this plan aimed to provide accountable and reliable information regarding programs and activities for achieving the national tourism development targets year 2015-2019. The National Long-Term Plan Year 2005 – 2025 was enacted in in Act 17 Year 2007 in order to strengthen the economy nationally but also to become globally competitive. In a public speech, the President of Indonesia announced that tourism is to be developed to increase the local people’s welfare and open employment opportunities. Moreover, the wise utilisation of natural resources, sustainable management, and the preservation of local cultures are major considerations as well (The President of Indonesia, 2007).

Both local and national governments determine the success of the tourism development of an area. According to Hamsinah (2017), the establishment of Otonomi Khusus (Special Autonomy) in the Land of Papua has empowered not only the local governments, but also local communities, to manage their region’s potential in order to achieve the goals of local development. They have greater opportunity to be the master of their own land. One of the tourist attractions in West Papua that is a good example of the success of local empowerment is Raja Ampat Islands, on the coast of Sorong, the largest city in West Papua. The development of tourism in Raja Ampat is now no longer dependent on national funding but is bringing in regional income.

### **D. Vocational Education as Lifelong Learning (LLL)**

Lifelong learning (LLL) has been part of the education debate since the 1960s (Cuffy, Tribe, & Airey, 2012). Nowadays, the world has acknowledged the significance of LLL and its

increasing importance in dealing with technology. Bahçelerli (2018) suggests that lifelong opportunities can be created through vocational schools as long as they can align their programs with the tourism businesses' expectations. Graduates of these schools should be able to manage effective personal development and have the ability to collaborate as well as practise efficient leadership, along with computer and communication technologies capability (Bahçelerli, 2018). This aligns with the Indonesian Ministry of Education's national strategic plan for the development of vocational high schools (Khurniawan, 2015), which all levels of policy makers, especially in the local areas, are expected to actively observe, mapping the schools' demands. Constant open dialogues are needed in such a process; otherwise the plans remain without realisation.

### **E. Tourism Policies through Vocational Education**

According to Kaushik (2014), vocational education is defined as occupational and employment-based education; it can be known as "career and technical education" or "technical vocational education and training", since the industry of travel and tourism is extremely diverse in terms of its subsector combinations, professions and criteria for talent. For the rapid improvement of this industry to be supported by corresponding human resources quantity and quality, policies have been developed in India to encourage and inspire many young people to enrol in hospitality and tourism educational and training programs (Dixit & Mawroh, 2019).

Governments' contributions to tourism and sector growth are widely accepted (Baum & Szivas, 2008). Policy makers in some developing countries have eventually become interested in increasing access to vocational education in order to raise the number of trained human resources. For example, Tanzania focused on this type of education in the late 1960s (Kahyarara & Teal, 2008), followed by South Korea thirty years later (Chung & KRIVET, 2009). India is another developing country that has made valuable investments in vocational education in tourism and hospitality and has tackled the same problems that Indonesia faces (Dixit & Mawroh, 2019). The Indian government (2014) has been focusing on a strategic planning that is expected to continuously produce skilled employees for its tourism industry. Thus, its tourism service remains well received and viable (Government of India, 2014). The Indian government has implemented two types of tourism vocational education, formal education and training programs. The formal education does not necessarily provide the practical skills that the job brand requires (Dixit & Mawroh, 2019). On the other hand, the vocational training programs include the provision of a diploma in the tourism and hospitality industry, mainly granted by the ITI (Industrial Education Institute) and the universities' industrial training centres. Instead of accepting the students with the most potential, these courses are usually filled with school dropouts from grades 8-12 or the 12-18-year-olds, (Government of India, 2015). The curricula of the training programs have many special categories that aim to prepare students practically for the work they will do in the industry.

In the Indonesian context, the establishment of hospitality and tourism as an independent field of study began on 31 March 2008. Letters from the Higher Education Directorate- General of the Republic of Indonesia No. 947/D / T/2007 and 948/D / T/2008 addressed to the Ministry of Culture and Tourism (now the Ministry of Tourism) expressed support for the establishment of bachelor's degree programs for tourism in two institutions run by the Ministry (H. Oktadiana & Chon, 2017). Even though, it can be said that the recognition of tourism education is quite new in the education system in Indonesia, there have been over two decades of efforts and

arguments by its scholars (Oktadiana & Chon, 2014).

There have been many improvements in the hospitality and tourism study programs, which have grown by 12% in 2010, with about twenty five institutions offering vocational and/or academic bachelor programs (H. Oktadiana & Chon, 2017). It is clearly seen that Indonesia has proven its seriousness in filling the gaps of tourism professionals, such as scholars/ researchers, tourism planners, and policymakers with the purpose of equipping skilful or technical employees (Oktadiana & Chon, 2014). Nonetheless, there are still many unspecified differences between the vocational and academic education systems.

#### **F. Vocational High Schools in Tourism**

According to Mc Gladdery and Lubbe (2017), educational tourism has the ability to encourage education globally, but there is very little empirical research to support this argument. Their study has shown that not all vocational schools survive in this century; therefore, they have to enable students to experience various cultures in order to prepare them for the global aspects of the tourism industry. Mc Gladdery and Lubbe (2017) elaborate that students must be helped to develop personal characteristics of curiosity, humanitarianism and open-mindedness to new experiences. However, in reality, students' academic achievement at school tends to be unsatisfactory. Currently, the Indonesian governments has been considering developing educational tourism in high schools, since the basic education data of 2016 reported that the tourism business still needs personnel of around 625,429 people (Khurniawan, 2015). Importantly, the curriculum should be adjusted to the latest developments in the tourism business field, to produce highly qualified tourism personnel and graduates.

#### **G. Tourism as a Subject in Vocational Education**

Kolb's (1984) theory about experiential learning can be applied in the tourism education learning process and has been highly respected by scholars (van't Klooster, 2014). The theory proposed simply defines the learning process through which knowledge is generated by transformational experience, linking to the global requirements of education (McGladdery & Lubbe, 2017). According to Tarrant, Rubin, and Stoner (2014), in the era of globalisation, global awareness means a state of recognition and acknowledgement of others in the world and of the world's issues. In other words, tourism as a subject in vocational schools should be linked to a global mentality, with a greater sense of social responsibility towards both society as a whole and towards the world.

In order to increase the graduates' individual capabilities as potential competitive tourism agents, the national government has provided much support, such as the establishment of teaching factories and technoparks where strategic programs to improve the students' sense of global competitiveness in line with local business requirements (Khurniawan, 2015). However, it is recognised by the Indonesian educational government that there is need for qualified teachers in the high schools of tourism in West Papua who can effectively direct this type of learning (Budi, 2017). So, the fulfillment of tourism qualified teachers in quantity and quality must also be considered to maintain tourism vocational schools in West Papua.

#### **H. Worldview**

Tourism has globally served as a vehicle for socio-economic revolution, which has led to significant debates (Liu & Wall, 2006). It is used as an instrument for stimulating low economies and fostering growth through jobs and incomes. Even though not always stated

clearly, it is often assumed that by encouraging upward capital accumulation, tourism will reduce poverty. Liu and Wall (2006) further argue that tourism awareness differs between countries in the world, partly because of the many forms tourism can take, and partly because of the variety of destinations that attract and meet tourists' needs. There is therefore no widely accepted agreement on what tourism offers because the implications differ from place to place and are conditional (Liu & Wall, 2006). More elaborate commentary about the tourism industry, according to Liu and Wall (2006), is that it is commonly introduced in the developing world through a top-down planning strategy, since it is fundamentally dependent on the intervention of government instruments and big tourism organizations. The results are the empowerment of global capital and the marginalization of local people. Local communities are generally not involved as investors and decision makers, since locally there is a lack of knowledge of tourism and the related skills, and because policy makers prioritise economic growth, with little regard for equity (Cohen, 1996). This accords with neoliberalism values which view the educational sector as a commodity that can bring monetary benefit (Davies & Bansel, 2007).

Young people in the twenty-first century are not only expected to fulfil the needs of international competitiveness so they can survive social-economically, but also have to be well prepared as well-rounded human beings. To cultivate humanity, as Nussbaum (2002) postulates, education in the era of global connections should be about developing a curriculum that encourages diversity and teaches students mindfulness, respect and willingness to recognise and respect others regardless of their origin, social class, gender, ethnicity, or place of birth. One of the approaches supporting this view is the promotion of positive mental health in school. This strategy has been increasingly acknowledged in the international education over the past decades, since it links to wellbeing and decreases inner and externalised problems such as insecurity, depression, drug abuse, aggression and antisocial behaviour (Askell-Williams & Lawson, 2013).

### **I. Lifelong Learning Tourism Education**

Marshall and Marrett (2008, p. 2) describe life-long learning as “related to the idea of a knowledge-based economy that generates the need for learning to occur throughout a lifetime of a person”. As we now live in a modern civilization, LLL education becomes very critical regarding to the need for the ability to anticipate and adapt to change (Mckenzie, 1998). The same precepts of lifelong learning are important to apply in tourism education programs if tourism education is to survive (Cuffy et al., 2012). The ideal factors for an effective tourism education program are the relevance to its context (Smith & Cooper, 2000) and also the careful study of the existing social, cultural and economic conditions (Lewis, 2004).

## **METHODOLOGY**

This study applies the Causal Layered Analysis (CLA) (Inayatullah, 1990) to identify what has been happening during the years of the school's establishment, and to predict possible solutions towards the problems of tourism vocational high schools regarding student numbers and curriculum to improve its contribution to the sector in the province of West Papua. CLA as a methodology involves a deliberate attempt to disturb existing power dynamics by questioning our definitions and stimulating construction of alternate future scenarios (Inayatullah, 1990). It consists of four layers, namely Litany, Social Causes/Systemic, Discourse/ Worldview, and

Myth/ Metaphor. The Litany comprises a description of the issues as seen by the public. They are the most visible and obvious perceptions, frequently overstated, particularly in the reports of the news media. The Social Causes/Systemic layer involves an exploration of the social causes that have led to the issues listed in the litany, including the economic, cultural, political and historical factors behind the issues. The Discourse/World view frames the analysis. This involves exploring the deeper assumptions behind the issue and the beliefs that have shaped the systems and litany. Myth/Metaphor proposes deeper narratives and discovers the common elements, and the subconscious, sometimes upsetting, or paradoxical elements. Inayatullah (1990) points out that in order to construct alternate futures on the vertical level of future studies, with the CLA study layers; the possible fundamental discourses are given more space to appear, while the present situation loosens its hold.

## **DISCUSSION**

### **A. New Worldview**

The vocational school has been linked with the idea of Lifelong Learning (LLL), which, according to Bahçelerli (2018), is about management of individual enhancement along with practising effective leadership. Therefore, Nussbaum's (2002) argument regarding cultivating humanity suits the vocational education's idea of LLL. The proposed critical key outcomes for the future of creating a fully active person and making efforts to create a deeply interconnected world can also be seen as part of cultivating humanity, which involves the following actions. First, critical self-examination and thinking about one's own culture and traditions. Second, seeing oneself as a human being who is bound to all humans with ties of concern, and lastly, enabling narrative imagination - the ability to empathize with others and to put oneself in another's place. Meanwhile, another scholar who has contributed to social sciences and humanities, Amartya Sen, proposes a pioneering view of capability. Sen's (1993) definition of capability is a person's ability to perform valuable acts or to attain important conditions of being; capability reflects an optional combination of things that a person can do or is capable of doing. In other words, capabilities are opportunities or freedoms to achieve what an individual reflectively considers valuable (Walker & Unterhalter, 2007). His view about capability refers to poverty as a capability failure, instead of income shortage (Sen, 1993). In the next section, the main systemic is discussed in terms of alternative future that depends on the capability of improvement of each individual's role in any group of people in the system.

### **B. New Systemic**

Innovation or Continuous Improvement (CI) – the constant search for better products, procedures, customer service, etc (Bessant & Caffyn, 1997) – has been well recognised as a successful way to secure competitive advantage and as a more efficient approach to the defence of strategic positions (Tidd, Bessant, & Pavitt, 2009). However, Tidd et al. (2009) argue that this does not guarantee success at all. Many organisations claim that they need more innovation, but even luck can be a success factor. However, Tidd et al. (2009) think that real success comes from the ability to “repeat the trick” (p. 40). In other words, to continuously and seriously take control of the sequence of actions.

The fundamental aspect required in the innovation process, according to Bessant and Caffyn (1997), should be increasing creativity in solving problems, instead of the variety of “discovery”. Furthermore, Crosswhite and Rufat-Latre (2009) suggest it is better to base

innovation on the recognised current obstacles, then gradually eliminate them, rather than define one new set of actions and strategies after another. Even though the problem seems to be the smallest and the simplest, as long as the solution contributes to the desired changes, the process is worth maintaining (Crosswhite & Rufat-Latre, 2009).

An innovation project takes advantage of Tidd and Bessant's (2009) "4Ps" model: position, product, process, and paradigm (Appendix D), which refers to "paradigm innovation", that is shifts in the mental models driving the organization's operations, and "repositioning the perception of an established product in a particular user context" (p. 11). Through "paradigm innovation" the problems that need to be solved can be structured and articulated, which then naturally leads to the solutions (Barker, 1997). Furthermore, Schein (1999) argues that what is shared mentally is the crucial part of an organisation and hard to shift, since it is steady and lies at the deeper level. So, the "paradigm model" will have a greater chance to succeed. In other words, to get a long lasting result, the plan will be directed towards "reculturing". Fullan (2001) suggests that the ideal action of "change" in an organisation is changing "the way we do things around here" (p. 44), instead of the organisation's structure. An example of this model is how Henry Ford radically shifted the image of transportation by altering the concept from rare special models designed for wealthy people to affordable products for everyone (Tidd et al., 2009). However, managing the paradigm innovation will take time, since it deals with the old culture that has been embedded for years within the organisation, and, more significantly, is a new undertaking for the organisation. Thus, an incremental plan, which consists of several actions in transforming the old idea in stages (Tidd et al., 2009), is considered to be extremely important as well.

### **C. Relational Leadership through Multi Sector Cooperation**

Leadership is considered as the main focus on the innovation since it is believed that it can solve personal, social, and organisational problems (Barker, 1997). In the future, there will be no more slogans: "Managers are people who do things right and leaders are people who do the right things" (Bennis & Nanus, 1985). Even though it has long been well understood that in this globalisation era it is crucial to improve individual capability starting from the school, leadership best experienced when the knowledge is formed and shared socially (Uhl-Bien, 2006). Thus, relational leadership is going to be applied in the future, since it has been recognized worldwide now that it is the ideal model of leadership in the rising knowledge economies and organisational needs of the twenty first century (Uhl-Bien, 2006).

A mental shift will be required from putting the leader as the centre to trusting in the various influential thought processes of the members of the organisation. This approach is created through social developments taking place in and through interactions between people (Fletcher, 2004). Senge (2006) defines the process as the "learning organisation", which is a state of constantly learning together and getting "learningful" at all stages within the organisation. Interestingly, one part of the process of a learning organisation (Appendix E), is "personal mastery", which involves the lifelong learning of the individual (Senge, 2006). The learning organisation may take place during dialogue including "thinking together", as the team seeks knowledge that cannot be acquired individually. For instance, the process of listening to each other identifies the competencies and shortcomings of other participants, notices the beneficial knowledge and skills, and avoids unfamiliar things. Another important aspect that needs to be included in the new systemic leadership model is that of "coherence making" (Fullan & Quinn, 2016), which is the in-depth shared understanding in terms of the nature of



the work. Just as explained previously about the others aspects, this factor is also improved through communication within the team during the daily work, recognizing and adopting what works and always creating meaningful moments (Fullan & Quinn, 2016). These factors are incorporated in the Appreciative Inquiry approach.

Appreciative Inquiry (AI) (Cooperrider, 1996) is a strategy that involves a paradigm change that transforms wholly. The approach prioritises the highly value-added areas contributed by the appreciative method (Cooperrider, 1996). AI encourages positivity in professional practise by asking questions about the best times and moments of a particular issue that may redirect the thoughts about challenges and shortages and contribute to the “best” potential (Hammond & French). Cooperrider (1996) argues that “problem solving” mostly had people searching backwards over the past’s reasons. It rarely results in new visions, since we are busy filling in the gaps. Moreover, Cooperrider (1996) points out that problem solving leads to self-defensiveness. However, there is no thorough examination of the importance of keeping leadership sustainable through cross-disciplinary collaborative approaches (Kurucz, Colbert, Luedeke- Freund, Upward, & Willard, 2017). The tourism vocational high schools should have a clear framework in the new systemic layer to integrate them with the many sectors involved in the development of the West Papuan tourism high schools, which are the local governments (Ministry of Tourism and Ministry of Education), tourism businesses, and the civil society. Kurucz et al. (2017) argue that the complex challenges in firms stem from the concepts integrated in the practice.

## CONCLUSION

Young children learn through repetition, but repetition should be meaningful and enjoyable. Luckily, at younger ages, children often ask to repeat songs they love. It can be fun for them when the teacher plays with the different aspects of music, such as tempo, volume, and rhythm. Altering these can also serve as language exercises to help students improve fluency, pronunciation, intonation, and retention. Students can tap or shake a percussion instrument and keep the beat of the songs. Keeping the beat can help children hear the rhythm of the language, help them produce stress and intonation accurately, and improve their fluency. Using instruments to accompany songs sounds great, but not all teachers have instruments available. Luckily, creating percussion instruments is easy. Almost any object can be used as a percussion instrument when tapped on the floor or a desk. Teachers may not want to encourage students to use objects such as pens, pencils, and rulers nor have students do rhythm games at their desks because students may tap rhythms later. These songs are short, fun, and easy to sing, and they use actual language young learners can use outside the classroom. Teachers can find simple gestures for each line that add movement to the routines. Teachers can also create their songs using familiar catchy tunes like these for other routines. Some teachers like to have an attention-getter song or chant that helps manage student behavior. Others like to use a clean-up song after project work. It all depends on what works best for each teacher’s classroom.

The use of Causal Layered Analysis in this project has demonstrated how this creative and imaginative method can solve a problem systematically. The analysis involves looking more deeply at the present and previous circumstances to predict alternative futures instead of simply giving up in face of difficulties. In addition, the key concepts identified and supported by the relevant literature underpin the project implications and recommendations.

## REFERENCES

- Andarina, A. P. (2008). Sekolah Menengah Kejuruan Pariwisata bertaraf internasional di Semarang. *Jurusan Arsitektur Fakultas Teknik Undip*.
- Askill-Williams, H., & Lawson, M. J. (2013). Teachers' knowledge and confidence for promoting positive mental health in primary school communities. *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, 41(2), 126-143.
- Bahçelerli, N. M. (2018). Strategy for lifelong learning in vocational schools of tourism education. *Quality & Quantity*, 52(1), 43-58.
- Barker, R. A. (1997). How can we train leaders if we do not know what leadership is? *Human Relations*, 50(4), 343-362.
- Baum, T., & Szivas, E. (2008). HRD in tourism: A role for government? *Tourism Management*, 29(4), 783-794.
- Bennis, W., & Nanus, B. (1985). *Leaders: The strategies for taking charge*. New York: Harper & Row.
- Bessant, J., & Caffyn, S. (1997). High-Involvement innovation through Continuous Improvement. *International Journal of Technology Management*, 14(1), 7-28.
- Bradbury, H., & Lichtenstein, B. M. B. (2000). Relationality in organizational research: Exploring the space between. *Organization Science*, 11(5), 551-564.
- Cabolis, C. (2017). Has the world become more globalized?
- Chung, J., & KRIVET. (2009). Pre-employment Vocational Education and Training in Korea. In (Vol. 52186): The World Bank.
- Cohen, E. (1996). Hunter-gatherer tourism in Thailand. *Tourism and indigenous peoples.*, 227-254.
- Cooperrider, D. L. (1996). Resources for getting Appreciative Inquiry started. *OD practitioner*, 28(1&2), 23-34.
- Crosswhite, D., & Rufat-Latre, J. (2009). Systematically innovate! What sounds like an oxymoron is actually a recipe for dependable results. *Business Strategy Series*, 10(2), 79-85.
- Cuffy, V., Tribe, J., & Airey, D. (2012). Lifelong learning for tourism. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 39(3), 1402-1424.
- Davies, & Bansel, P. (2007). Neoliberalism and Education. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education*, 20(3), 247-259.
- Dixit, S. K., & Mawroh, H. (2019). Vocational education and training for hospitality and tourism industry in India. In *Tourism Education and Asia* (pp. 35-48): Springer.
- Drath, W. H. (2001). *The deep blue sea: Rethinking the source of leadership.*: Jossey-Bass San Francisco, CA.
- Evans, N., Stonehouse, G., & Campbell, D. (2012). *Strategic management for travel and tourism.*: Taylor & Francis.
- Fletcher, J. K. (2004). The paradox of postheroic leadership: An essay on gender, power, and transformational change. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 15(5), 647-661.
- Fullan, M. (2001). *Leading in a Culture of Change*. Somerset, US: John Wiley & Sons.
- Fullan, M., & Quinn, J. (2016). Coherence: The right drivers in action for schools, districts, and systems. *The Teacher*, 54(5), 6.
- Government of India. (2015). *Skill development in India*. New Delhi
- Hammond, S., & French, N. *The thin book of Appreciative Inquiry*. Bend, Oregon: Thin Book Publishing Co.

- Hamsinah, B. (2017). Perencanaan dan pengembangan sumberdaya terhadap industri pariwisata di Kabupaten Raja Ampat, Papua Barat. *Inovasi*, 3(1).
- Harvey, D. (2007). Neoliberalism as creative destruction. *The annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 610(1), 21-44.
- Inayatullah, S. (1990). Deconstructing and Reconstructing the Future: Predictive, Cultural and Critical Epistemologies. *Futures*, 22(2), 115-141.
- Indriaturrahmi, I., & Sudiyatno, S. (2016). Peran dunia usaha dan dunia industri dalam penyelenggaraan SMK berbasis kearifan lokal di kota Mataram. *Jurnal Pendidikan Vokasi*, 6(2), 162-172.
- Jiang, B., & Tribe, J. (2009). Tourism jobs-short lived professions: Student attitudes towards tourism careers in China. *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sports and Tourism Education (Pre-2012)*, 8(1), 4.
- Jun, J. S., & Wright, D. S. (1996). *Globalization and decentralization: Institutional contexts, policy issue, and intergovernmental relations in Japan and the United States*. Washington, D.C.: Georgetown University Press.
- Kahyarara, G., & Teal, F. (2008). The Returns to Vocational Training and Academic Education: Evidence from Tanzania. *World Development*, 36(11), 2223-2242.
- Kaushik, K. (2014). Vocational education in India. *International Journal of Education and Information Studies*, 4(1), 55-58.
- Khurniawan, A. W. (2015). SMK dari Masa ke Masa (A. W. Khurniawan & T. Haryani Eds.).
- Kolb, D. A. (1984). *Experiential learning: Experience as the source of learning and development*. FT press.
- Kurucz, E. C., Colbert, B. A., Luedeke-Freund, F., Upward, A., & Willard, B. (2017). Relational leadership for strategic sustainability: Practices and capabilities to advance the design and assessment of sustainable business models. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 140, 189-204.
- Lewis, A. (2004). Rationalising a tourism curriculum for sustainable tourism development in small island states: A stakeholder perspective. *Critical Issues in Tourism Education*, 9-15.
- Liu, A., & Wall, G. (2006). Planning tourism employment: a developing country perspective. *Tourism Management*, 27(1), 159-170.
- Marshall, S., & Marrett, C. (2008). External providers of tertiary education in the Commonwealth Caribbean. *Foreign Providers in the Caribbean: Pillagers or Preceptors?*
- Martinez, E., & Garcia, A. (2000). What is neo-liberalism? A brief definition. *Global Exchange*, 26.
- McGladdery, C. A., & Lubbe, B. A. (2017). International educational tourism: Does it foster global learning? A survey of South African high school learners. *Tourism Management*, 62, 292-301.
- Mckenzie, P. (1998). Lifelong learning as a policy response. *Monash University: ACER Centre for the Economics of Education and Training and ACER*.
- Ministry of Tourism, R. o. I. (2019). Indonesia Tourism Ministry wins best National Tourism Organisation (NTO): *TTG Travel Awards 2018*.
- Newhouse, D., & Suryadarma, D. (2011). The Value of Vocational Education: High School Type and Labor Market Outcomes in Indonesia. *The World Bank Economic Review*, 25(2), 296-322.
- Nussbaum, M. (2002). Education for Citizenship in an Era of Global Connection. *Studies in Philosophy Education & Training*, 21(4-5), 289-303.

- Oktadiana, & Chon, K. (2014). A review of programs and program directions of the Indonesia's hospitality and tourism study at the undergraduate level. Paper presented at the *Asia Pacific Council on Hotel, Restaurant, and Institutional Education (APacCHRIE) Conference, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, 21-24 May, 2014*
- Oktadiana, H., & Chon, K. (2017). Vocational versus academic debate on undergraduate education in hospitality and tourism: the case of Indonesia. *Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Education*, 29(1), 13-24.
- Puspitasari, W. (2019, 5 April 2019). Pengamat: Sektor pariwisata Indonesia alami perkembangan signifikan. *Antara*.
- Sakhiyya, Z. (2011). Interrogating identity: The international standard school in Indonesia. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society*, 19(3), 345-365.
- Schein, E. H. (1999). *The corporate culture survival guide : sense and nonsense about culture change.*: San Francisco, Calif. : Jossey-Bass
- Sen, A. (1993). Capability and well-being. In M. Nussbaum & A. Sen (Eds.), *The quality of life*. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- Senge, P. M. (2006). *The fifth discipline : The art and practice of the learning organization*. London: London : Random House.
- Smith, G., & Cooper, C. (2000). Competitive approaches to tourism and hospitality curriculum design. *Journal of Travel Research*, 39(1), 90-95.
- Subrahmanyam, G. (2014). Vocational education: why the Finns do it best. *The Guardian.*, 16 January 2014.
- Tarrant, M. A., Rubin, D. L., & Stoner, L. (2014). The added value of study abroad: Fostering a global citizenry. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 18(2), 141-161.
- Tidd, J., Bessant, J. R., & Pavitt, K. (2009). *Managing innovation: Integrating technological, market and organizational change*: John Wiley & Sons.
- Uhl-Bien, M. (2006). Relational leadership theory: exploring the social processes of leadership and organizing. *The Leadership Quarterly*, 17(6), 654-676.
- Van't Klooster, E. E. (2014). Travel to learn: The influence of cultural distance on competence development in educational travel. (No. EPS-2014-312 - MKT). *ERIM Ph.D. Series Research in Management*. Erasmus Research Institute of Management. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/1765/51462>
- Wadham, B. A., Pudsey, J., & Boyd, R. (2007). *Culture and Education*. Frenchs Forest, N.S.W.: Frenchs Forest, N.S.W. : Pearson Education Australia.
- Walker, M., & Unterhalter, E. (2007). *Amartya Sen's capability approach and social justice in education*. New York, N.Y.: New York, N.Y. : Palgrave Macmillan.
- Walmsley, A. (2004). Assessing staff turnover: a view from the English Riviera. *International Journal of Tourism Research*, 6(4), 275-287.